

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ANTITRUST LITIGATION (MDL NO. 2406))))))	Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP This document relates to: SUBSCRIBER TRACK CASES
--	-----------------------	---

**EVIDENTIARY SUBMISSION IN SUPPORT OF
SUBSCRIBER PLAINTIFFS' CONSOLIDATED MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' AMENDED AND RESTATED MOTION BASED ON
THE FILED RATE DOCTRINE FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT ON THE ALABAMA
SUBSCRIBERS' DAMAGES CLAIMS, AND IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' CROSS-
MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

DESCRIPTION	EXHIBIT
2000-03-02 DOI Letter to BCBSAL re: Small Group Category Rate Filing Carden PX 07 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	1
2003-05-01 DOI Regulation 482-1-024 Ostlund PX 10.....	2
2008-03-28 BCBAL Actuarial Letter to Commissioner Bell Ostlund PX 21 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	3
2008-10-20 Individual Blue 2005 Plans Rate Filing Ostlund PX 12 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	4
2009-07-20 Sample Workbook Showing General Program Criteria.....	5
2011-03-22 2011 Small Group Rate Filing Ostlund PX 07 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	6
2011-12-19 DOI Health Insurance Rate Review Grant Program Report Ostlund PX 11.....	7
2012-02-01 DOI Filing Information Ostlund PX 06.....	8

2012-03-01	Sample small group rate filing for 2012 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	9
2012-03-09	E-mail re Questions small group filing and rate bill Ostlund PX 14 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	10
2013-05-02	BCBSAL Actuarial Memorandum and Certification Ostlund PX 08 [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	11
2016-01-11	Declaration of Noel Carden [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	12
2016-03-04	E-mail re Rate Review Survey Ostlund PX 05.....	13
2016-03-04	E-mail re AL Rate Review Response Ostlund PX 04.....	14
2016-03-16	DOI Rates and Forms FAQs Ostlund PX 18.....	15
2016-05-03	Final Report re Medical Loss Ratio Examination Ostlund PX 16	16
2016-07-25	E-mail re Background Info on BCBS rate variance Ostlund PX 15.....	17
2016-07-29	Deposition Min-u-Script of Noel Carden [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	18
2016-07-31	AL Code 10a-20-6.01 Ostlund PX 03.....	19
2016-08-04	Deposition Min-u-Script of Steven Ostlund [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	20
2016-08-10	Stipulation and Order as to Scope of Filed Rate Defense	21
2016-08-29	Declaration of Noel Carden [CONFIDENTIAL/UNDER SEAL].....	22
2016-09-20	Demonstrative showing group-size adjustments over class period	23

Respectfully submitted the 23rd day of September, 2016,

David Boies
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP
333 Main Street
Armonk, NY 10504
Tel: (914) 749-8200
Fax: (914) 749-8200
dboies@bsfllp.com

William A. Isaacson
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP
5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20015
Tel: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
wisaacson@bsfllp.com

Michael Hausfeld
William Butterfield
HAUSFELD LLP
1700 K Street NW, Suite 650
Washington, DC 20006
Tel: (202) 540-7200
Fax: (202) 540-7201
mhausfeld@hausfeldllp.com
wbutterfield@hausfeldllp.com

Megan Jones
HAUSFELD LLP
44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400
San Francisco, CA 94104
Tel: (415) 744-1970
Fax: (415) 358-4980
mjones@hausfeldllp.com

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale
Barry A. Ragsdale
SIROTE & PERMUTT P.C.
P.O. Box 55727
Birmingham, AL 35255-5727
Tel: (205) 930-5114
Fax: (205) 212-2932
bragsdale@sirote.com

Gregory Davis
DAVIS & TALIAFERRO, LLC
7031 Halcyon Park Drive
Montgomery, AL 36117
Tel: (334) 832-9080
Fax: (334) 409-7001
gldavis@knology.net

Chris T. Hellums
PITTMAN, DUTTON & HELLUMS, P.C.
2001 Park Place N, 1100 Park Place Tower
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 322-8880
Fax: (205) 328-2711
chrish@pittmandutton.com

Cyril V. Smith
Daniel P. Moylan
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER, LLP
100 East Pratt Street, Suite 2440
Baltimore, MD 21202-1031
Tel: (410) 949-1145
Fax: (410) 659-0436
csmith@zuckerman.com
dmoylan@zuckerman.com

David Guin
Tammy Stokes
GUIN, STOKES & EVANS, LLC
300 Richard Arrington Jr. Blvd. N.
Suite 600
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 226-2282
Fax: (205) 226-2357
davidg@gseattorneys.com
tammys@gseattorneys.com

Kathleen Chavez
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC
10 West State Street, Suite 200
Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (630) 232-7452
kcc@fmcolaw.com

Eric L. Cramer
BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C.
1622 Locust Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: 1-800-424-6690
Fax: (215) 875-4604
ecramer@bm.net

Patrick Cafferty
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER & SPRENGEL
LLP
101 North Main Street, Suite 565
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
Tel: (734) 769-2144
Fax: (734) 769-1207
pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com

Andrew Lemmon
LEMMON LAW FIRM
650 Poydras Street, Suite 2335
New Orleans, LA 70130
Tel: (504) 581-5644
Fax: (504) 581-2156
andrew@lemmonlawfirm.com

Karen Dyer
Hamish P.M. Hume
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP
5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20015
Tel: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
tchutkan@bsflp.com
kdyer@bsflp.com
hhume@bsflp.com
kkiernan@bsflp.com

Bryan Clobes
Ellen Meriwether
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER & SPRENGEL
LLP
1101 Market Street, Suite 2650
Philadelphia, PA 19107
Tel: (215) 864-2800
Fax: (215) 864-2810
bclobes@caffertyclobes.com
meriwether@caffertyclobes.com

Carl S. Kravitz
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
1800 M Street NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036-5807
Tel: (202) 778-1800
Fax: (202) 822-8106
ckravitz@zuckerman.com

Douglas Dellaccio
CORY WATSON CROWDER & DEGARIS, P.C.
2131 Magnolia Avenue, Suite 200
Birmingham, AL 32505
Tel: (205) 328-2200
Fax: (205) 324-7896
ddellaccio@cwcd.com

Chris Cowan
THE COWAN LAW FIRM
209 Henry Street
Dallas, TX 74226-1819
Tel: (214) 826-1900
Fax: (214) 826-8900
chris@cowanlaw.net

Charles T. Caliendo
GRANT & EISENHOFER
485 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017
Tel: (646) 722-8500
Fax: (646) 722-8501
ccaliendo@gelaw.com

Daniel Gustafson
Daniel C. Hedlund
GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 333-8844
Fax: (612) 339-6622
dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com

Brent Hazzard
HAZZARD LAW, LLC
447 Northpark Drive
Ridgeland, MS 39157
Tel: (601) 977-5253
Fax: (601) 977-5236
brenthazzard@yahoo.com

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.
Benjamin Sweet
DEL SOLE CAVANAUGH STROYD LLC
200 First Avenue, Suite 300
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
Tel: (412) 261-2393
Fax: (412) 261-2110
ekilpela@dsclaw.com
bsweet@dsclaw.com

Robert M. Foote
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC
10 West State Street, Suite 200
Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (630) 232-7452
rmf@fmcclaw.com

Robert Eisler
GRANT & EISENHOFER
123 Justison Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
Tel: (302) 622-7000
Fax: (302) 622-7100
reisler@gelaw.com

Arthur Bailey
HAUSFELD LLP
44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400
San Francisco, CA 94104
Tel: (415) 744-1970
Fax: (415) 358-4980
abailey@hausfeldllp.com

John Saxon
JOHN D. SAXON, P.C.
2119 3rd Avenue North
Birmingham, AL 35203-3314
Tel: (205) 324-0223
Fax: (205) 323-1583
jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com

Lawrence Jones
JONES WARD PLC
312 South Fourth Street, Sixth Floor
Louisville, Kentucky 40202
Tel: (502) 882-6000
larry@jonesward.com

Robert Methvin
James M. Terrell
MCCALLUM, METHVIN & TERRELL, P.C.
The Highland Building
2201 Arlington Avenue South
Birmingham, AL 35205
Tel: (205) 939-0199
Fax: (205) 939-0399
rgm@mmlaw.net
jterrell@mmlaw.net

H. Lewis Gillis
MEANS GILLIS LAW, LLC
3121 Zelda Court
Montgomery, AL 36106
Tel: 1-800-626-9684
hlgillis@tmgslaw.com

Dianne M. Nast
NASTLAW LLC
1101 Market Street, Suite 2801
Philadelphia, PA 19107
Tel: (215) 923-9300
Fax: (215) 923-9302
dnast@nastlaw.com

Edgar D. Gankendorff
Eric R.G. Belin
PROVOSTY & GANKENDORFF, LLC
650 Poydras Street, Suite 2700
New Orleans, LA 70130
Tel: (504) 410-2795
Fax: (504) 410-2796
egankendorff@provostylaw.com
ebelin@provostylaw.com

Virginia Buchanan
LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS MITCHELL
RAFFERTY & PROCTOR, P.A.
316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600
Pensacola, FL 32502
Tel: (850) 435-7000
Fax: (850) 435-7020
vbuchanan@levinlaw.com

Michael McGartland
MCGARTLAND & BORCHARDT LLP
1300 South University Drive, Suite 500
Fort Worth, TX 76107
Tel: (817) 332-9300
Fax: (817) 332-9301
mike@attorneysmb.com

David J. Hodge
MORRIS, KING & HODGE
200 Pratt Avenue NE
Huntsville, AL 35801
Tel: (256) 536-0588
Fax: (256) 533-1504
lstewart@alinjurylaw.com

Patrick W. Pendley
Christopher Coffin
PENDLEY, BAUDIN & COFFIN, LLP
Post Office Drawer 71
Plaquemine, LA 70765
Tel: (225) 687-6369
pwpendley@pbclawfirm.com
ccoffin@pbclawfirm.com

Richard Rouco
QUINN, CONNOR, WEAVER, DAVIES & ROUCO
LLP
2700 Highway 280 East, Suite 380
Birmingham, AL 35223
Tel: (205) 870-9989
Fax: (205) 870-9989
rrouco@qcwdr.com

Garrett Blanchfield
REINHARDT, WENDORF & BLANCHFIELD
E-1250 First National Bank Building
332 Minnesota Street
St. Paul, MN 55101
Tel: (651) 287-2100
Fax: (651) 287-2103
g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com

Jason Thompson
SOMMERS SCHWARTZ
One Towne Square, 17th Floor
Southfield, MI 48076
Tel: (248) 355-0300
jthompson@sommerspc.com

Larry McDevitt
David Wilkerson
VAN WINKLE LAW FIRM
11 North Market Street
Asheville, NC 28801
Tel: (828) 258-2991
lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com
dwilkerson@vwlawfirm.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I served a copy of the above and foregoing upon all counsel of record in this case by filing a copy of same via ECF on this the 23rd day of September, 2016.

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale
Of Counsel